

Report on
Final Evaluation of the Project titled
“Education and Health for Child Waste Pickers”

Submitted to:
ChildHope UK
The Green House
244-254 Cambridge Heath Road
London, E2 9DA

Submitted by:
Mozammel Hoque
Consultant – Development Programmes
Flat: 4C, House: 71
Road: 11A, Dhanmondi R.A.
Dhaka-1209

11 March 2019

List of Acronyms

| | |
|------|---|
| GUC | Gram Bangla Unnayan Committee |
| TOR | Terms of Reference |
| R.A. | Residential Area |
| UK | United Kingdom |
| TVET | Technical and Vocational Education and Training |
| PWD | People with Disability |
| SHG | Self-help Group |
| BDT | Bangladesh Taka |
| RMG | Readymade Garments |
| NGO | Non-governmental Organisation |

Executive Summary

The project has been implemented during July 2015-December 2018 in Bangladesh by the Gram Bangla Unnayan Committee (GUC) during 2015-2018 as a partner of ChildHope (UK), on funding by the Big Lottery Fund (UK). The evaluation was conducted as a comprehensive analysis considering the baseline situation and the subsequent project achievements considering all related information available.

Outcome-level Achievements:

There was over-achievement (241 children) against the target number (200) of children to be enrolled in the project's primary school. Eligible students were also admitted (138 against a target of 300 students) into mainstream schools of the project locality. Number of female students (32 out of 130) admitted into mainstream schools was around a double of that for male students (12 out of 111).

Against a target to impart TVET to 300 children, the project saw TVET provided to 220 in total. While the initial plan was to provide training on six trades, subsequent changes in market demand for various commodities forced the project to limit its TVET-based training on four trades only, that is, Industrial Sewing, Mobile Phone Servicing, Jute and Paper Bag making, and Food Processing. Among all, training on Industrial sewing was the most popular, all participants there being girls.

Eight Self-help Groups (SHGs) were formed in order to enable target households attain subsistence – level economic wellbeing. Only one among them got disbanded after having operated for some time. These groups have saved money in their won bank accounts operated by their managing committees as per their Group By-laws. The money saved thus is being disbursed as loans to the SHG members for various purposes, mostly business purposes, with personal purposes on a limited scale.

The project witnessed regularly increasing progress in achievements against Outcome 4 as a result of regular advocacy and lobbying. The process paved the way for bargaining on rights of the project beneficiaries with the local government for them to access various social safety net-based benefits, such as old age allowance, PWDs' allowance, widow allowance and VGD.

Effectiveness of Approaches Followed:

The above-target enrolment of students at the GUC Primary School and mainstreaming of many of these students into the country's public education system has engendered high-level enthusiasm among the direct beneficiaries as well as the local community members. They are now willing and planning to make the school and the TVET Centre self-sustainable. The mothers of the students at the GUC School are also now motivated to let their children continue receiving further education in future. Close and frequent contacts with the local education office facilitated registration of the GUC's schoolteachers as a recognized education workforce in the project locality.

Among the TVET courses, Industrial Sewing has been the most popular trade. This trade has proved viable and preferable to the female students for various socio-economic reasons. Besides, it was relatively easier to fetch job orders from the local market for making clothes for especially the kids. The growth of mini readymade garment factories at the project's neighbourhood also opened scope for job

orders to the GUC TVET Centre for making garments. The female students at certain localities of Matuail are pursuing their businesses in Food Processing, allowing these girls to carry on businesses from their slum-based homes and at the same time attending their other home-based responsibilities. Some adults, mothers of target children, having learnt the art of business from their children, started their own businesses too. Some of them have gained significant profits out of these new business operations.

Whatever outcome-based achievements have been made by the SHGs, it is also apparent that the SHG members have been equipped with the knowledge and experience in running small cooperatives. One of the traits inculcated among the SHG members is the sense that their disbursement of loans must always be viable resulting to healthy loan recovery rate. The practical impact of understanding about importance of financial wellbeing among SHG members was also apparent to the consultant when he spoke to certain SHG members. The SHGs are confident that they have the likelihood of being able to sustain their SHG's operations in future even in absence of any support of GUC.

Key Success Factors and Challenges Faced:

Success Factors:

- The parents of the students at the GUC Primary School have become motivated enough to allow their children's continued education.
- Wider acceptance of the child waste-pickers as students by the other students and the teachers in the mainstream schools worked as a strong impetus for the students as well as their parents to support the children's education and their subsequent admission into mainstream schools.
- Cooperation of local education office and schools led to professional enrichment of GUC School and its teachers.
- As a result of improved economic status, a few of the families returned to their rural homes in the southwestern districts of the country; and such success stories vigorously enhanced the motivation of the homogenous community of the target population.
- The philanthropic activities of the local elite to benefit the project women and their families pervaded, especially from the second year of project activities.
- The teacher : student ratio at the GUC School is significantly higher than those generally prevailing in other local (mainstream) schools. This gave the GUC School's teachers an edge over those in other local schools.
- Industrial Sewing is a trade that can be pursued easily with minimal capital and relatively high profitability. As such, its popularity grew significantly above those of other trades.
- There is abundant demand for kids' clothes existing in the Matuail market, which assisted the TVET students at the project to obtain a few job orders to make and supply such clothes.
- The local elected representatives' approval led to provision of various relief support to the project mothers under the Government's Social Safety Net Programme.
- The SHG members are remarkably money-cautious, and this trait of these women helped them to handle their own money carefully ensured profits for them and their SHGs.

Challenges Faced:

- Availability of PWDs among the target children was significantly low. By the end of 2018, total number of target PWDs was merely 11 against a target of 15.
- As men are usually considered the first-priority 'income-earners' in a typical Bangladeshi family, the project boys of Grade V are relatively less willing to further continue their education, consequently to be admitted to the mainstream schools.
- The widely prevailing view of girls as being required to work mostly at home acted, to some extent, against the attendance of girls at the GUIC Primary School.
- Although Nari Maitree primarily targeted imparting TVET-oriented training on six trades in all, subsequent changes in the demand pattern in the market locality forced them to limit themselves on four particular trades only, that is, Industrial Sewing, Mobile Phone Servicing, Jute and Paper Bag Making and Food Processing.
- Training on Mobile Phone Servicing needed some knowledge in hi-tech issues and a bit of better literacy, which were mostly lacking in majority of the TVET students.
- Persistent strong competition from big companies, manufacturing Jute and Paper Bags, was a deterrent to encouragement of TVET students to learn the art of making such bags.

GUC's Organisational Capacity:

Having recruited project staff timely, especially in the initial year (2015-16), the different positions in the project's organisation structure was well-equipped, having staff of the required specifications at both GUC HQ in Dhaka and the Project's field area. At a subsequent stage, even in the face increased responsibilities on GUC with a change in partnership pattern, this lead partner (GUC) managed the project with enough staffing for three Project Outcomes- Outcome # 1, 3 and 4. Staff capacity clearly showed signs of improvement. In order to ensure smooth and un-interrupted monitoring of the project, the lead partner NGO recruited an M&E Officer immediately on initiation of the project's implementation activities. The consultant had close interactions with this M&E Officer, among other staff, at both the phases of the project's evaluation- mid-term and final evaluations. Both GUC and Nari Maitree followed closely the provisions of their relevant operations manuals in routine activities of the project.

ChildHope (UK)'s efforts for organizational development was regular, consisting of diverse steps, such as: training by outside consultants- local and international, ChildHope (UK)'s personnel, exchange visits in-country and abroad, and liaison with other international development partners for further strengthening GUC's future work for children.

Partnership Management:

GUC shouldered increased responsibilities as a partner as a consequence of some teething problems regarding partner-wise sharing of duties. Having done that, GUC led management of the project smoothly. Nari Maitree (responsible for implementing Outcome 2) and GUC (the lead partner) had a positive team chemistry in the changed scenario of partner-specific responsibility-sharing. Besides, Childhope (UK) gave all-out support to the two partners from the UK as well as through visits to the project offices and the project site at least once in six months. ChildHope (UK)'s support to the project

has been instrumental in that it led to necessary organizational strengthening of the implementing partner NGOs as well as ensuring compliance of project implementation and monitoring.

ChildHope's Role and Effectiveness:

ChildHope successfully carried out its double-sided responsibilities. On one hand, it maintained all sorts of communication, negotiation and reporting with BLF. On the other hand, it bore the responsibility for all-out implementation of the project in cooperation with the multiple partners in Bangladesh.

ChildHope's fulfilment of its responsibilities called for multiple visits of its representative(s) to Bangladesh, and frequent communication via emails and phone calls. In one word, the visits made by ChildHope personnel to the project country were at the same time for purpose of monitoring and mentoring. ChildHope also contributed significantly to staff development in Bangladesh and abroad on several occasions for GUC by way of diverse initiatives.

Financial Performance of the Project:

The project was implemented in compliance with all rules pertaining to financial operations following the requirements of all concerned parties to the project, that is, BLF, ChildHope (UK), GUC, Nari Maitree, and the Government of Bangladesh. Local audits were conducted regularly with audit firms selected as per the applicable rules made by the NGO Affairs Bureau (NGOAB) of Bangladesh. Both receipt and utilization of foreign funds (from BLF/ChildHope (UK)) were regularly reported to the NGOAB. ChildHope (UK), besides carrying out programmatic monitoring, also conducted periodic financial monitoring. To corroborate this process, ChildHope (UK) regularly received financial reports from GUC in three frequencies- quarterly, half-yearly and annually.

Recommendations:

The following suggestions are made in context of completion of the project's implementation:

- (a) Make/continue liaison with the local government (Union Parishad) at Matuail for mobilisation of all necessary resources available at their end to render sustainability to the project, such as:
 - Obtaining land for the GUC School and GUC TVET Centre; and
 - Registration of the GUC Primary School as a governmental registered primary school, so the government's MPO (Monthly Pay Order) and other support are available as the necessary financial resources.
- (b) Establish a strong linkage with the local market to explore potentials of selling commodities produced by the GUC TVET Centre in future (This proposal, at the outset, needs assurance of smooth and un-interrupted flow of necessary funds, including that for accommodation on any rental floor space).
- (c) ChildHope and GUC, along with other local representatives, should share the thoughts on possible future of the project (This conversation should follow preferences and priorities already shown by any donor approached by ChildHope and/or GUC)

- (d) Both ChildHope and GUC need to strategize a future approach to be made to other donors (than BLF) for rationally modified continuation of the project, especially in consideration of previous experiences faced in course of the immediately past project.

Table of Contents

- 1. INTRODUCTION
- 2. BACKGROUND OF THE PROJECT
- 3. PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVE OF THE EVALUATION
- 4. SCOPE OF THE EVALUATION
- 5. METHODOLOGY FOLLOWED
 - 5.1 The Concept
 - 5.2 Process Mechanism of the Evaluation
 - 5.3 Sources of Information and Information Collection Processes
- 6. MAJOR FINDINGS
 - 6.1 Outcome-level Achievements
 - 6.2 Effectiveness of Approaches Followed
 - 6.3 Key Success Factors and Challenges Faced
 - 6.4 GUC's Organisational Capacity
 - 6.5 Partnership Management
 - 6.6 ChildHope's Role and Effectiveness
 - 6.7 Financial Performance of the Project
- 7 RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEXES:

- I: Final Evaluation TOR
- II: Checklist Used in the Evaluation Survey
- III: List of Persons Met
- IV: Evaluation Schedule Followed
- V: Comprehensive Status of SHGs

1. INTRODUCTION

Preparation of this report, on final evaluation of the project “Education and Health for Child Waste Pickers”, was started in mid-November 2018. The project has been implemented in Bangladesh by the Gram Bangla Unnayan Committee (GUC) during 2015-2018 as a partner of ChildHope (UK). The project was funded by the Big Lottery Fund (UK). The mid-evaluation report on the project was concluded in July 2017.

2. BACKGROUND OF THE PROJECT

Having started its operations in July 2015, the project continued for 3.5 years up to December 2018. The Project Aim was: **Child, adolescent and women waste-pickers of Dhaka slums have the knowledge, skills, rights awareness and aspirations needed to access life changing opportunities and improve their health.**

The Expected Outcomes of the project were the following:

Outcome 1: 200 child waste-pickers (6-10 years - 60% girls and 10% children with a disability) access primary education (compliant with state government curriculum) and are integrated into mainstream schools leading to healthier lives and better life chances.

Outcome 2: 150 adolescent girl and boy waste-pickers (14-18 years) access Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), acquiring the livelihood skills needed to obtain safe alternative employment (75% female: 25% male of whom 10% will be adolescents with a disability).

Outcome 3: 100 waste-picking mothers improve their health and access non-hazardous occupations to supplement their income, so they are able to invest in the education and health of their children.

Outcome 4: 2,500 children, women and men (including the people with disabilities) are aware of their rights to education, employment and access basic entitlements, and engaging in policy discussions that affect them.

ChildHope (UK) and GUC, as one of their embedded practices, regularly prepared and circulated performance reports on the project on an annual basis.

3. PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVE OF THE EVALUATION

The purpose of this evaluation was to assess the achievements and challenges of the project. The evaluation also included an assessment of the grant’s overall performance in strengthening the organisational capacity of GUC and the effectiveness of the activities and approaches in relation to the achievement of the planned outcomes. Additionally, the relationship and added value of ChildHope were analysed.

The objectives of the evaluation were to:

- Collect and aggregate (gender & disability) quantitative and qualitative information on the progress of achievements against each Outcome and their milestones
- Assess the effectiveness of the approaches used by GUC to bring about long lasting change
- Assess changes in organisational capacity as a result of project activities, its partnership with Nari Maitree, and identify areas of focus for further development

- Identify and document the key success factors, challenges and learning from the intervention, and make recommendations based on these findings
- Assess the quality of relationship with ChildHope and the added value they have brought to the project.

4. SCOPE OF THE EVALUATION

In line with the given purpose and outcomes of the evaluation, the Scope of the Evaluation was supposed to contain a number of elements reflecting the project results at end of the implementation, as shown in details in the Terms of Reference (ToR) attached with this report as Annex-I. The detailed terms of reference fell under four major broad evaluative questions, such as-

- How effectively has the project achieved its outcomes?
- How has this made a difference (Activities and approaches used by the programme or implementing organisations)?
- How has the capacity of the organisation improved as a result of the intervention?
- Relationship with ChildHope (Approaches used and added value).

5. METHODOLOGY FOLLOWED

5.1 The Concept:

This was the second and final evaluation of the performance of the project “Education and Health for Child Waste Pickers” implemented by Grambangla Unnayan Committee (GUC) and ChildHope UK, in Dhaka city, supported by the BLF. The first and mid-term evaluation of the project was conducted in July 2017. The project’s operational timeframe was 3.5 years, from July 2015 to December 2018. As such, in course of this final evaluation, review was made based on information from both (i) all relevant secondary documents, inclusive of findings from the mid-term evaluation, and (ii) all findings from primary information sources pertaining to the end-line status of the project.

Besides, as the earlier evaluation was focused on the output-level Achievements, the consultant to this final evaluation tried to focus more and, as far as possible, on the Outcome-level Achievements. Besides, it was clear that the project, having just reached its terminal point, might not have optimal information on impacts of the project as a longer timeframe has to pass before trying to look into the impact-level results of the project. Additionally, recommendations flowing from this evaluation considered probable initiatives for both future improvement of the lives of the target children and their families as well as suggested future initiatives for GUC to be able to move toward its purported organizational goal and objectives.

5.2 Process Mechanism of the Evaluation:

The following sequential steps of activities were followed at par with the objective of the evaluation:

- (a) Reviewing the Baseline Situation highlighted in the project proposal
- (b) Reviewing the Outcomes proposed in the project proposal in 2015
- (c) Measuring the Qualitative and Quantitative achievements made by the Project by end of December 2018 against the pre-determined Outcomes

- (d) Reviewing the achievements made in between the mid-term evaluation and the end of the Project
- (e) Exploring and analysing the reasons, external and internal to the project, of Over/Under-achievements against specific outcomes
- (f) Suggesting Recommendations for the Target Beneficiaries' future socio-economic development, especially in line with their Unmet Needs as measured against the Project Baseline Situation.

5.3 Sources of Information and Information Collection Processes:

The following information collection processes were followed.

Table 1: Information Collection Processes Followed

| Sl. No. | Information to be Collected | Sources of Information | Information Collection Process | Proposed Information Collection Tool |
|---------|---|---|--|--------------------------------------|
| 1 | Baseline Situation highlighted in the project proposal | Proposal submitted to BLF | --- Secondary Review --- | Reference to Given ToR |
| 2 | Outcomes proposed in the project proposal in 2015 | Proposal submitted to BLF | --- Secondary Review --- | Reference to Given ToR |
| 3 | Qualitative and Quantitative achievements made by the Project by end of December 2018 against the pre-determined Outcomes | (a) Annual Reports for Y1-3 (b) BLF Grambangla Mid-term evaluation | --- Secondary Review --- | Reference to Given ToR |
| 4 | Achievements made in between the Mid-term evaluation and the end of the Project | (a) Annual report Y3 (b) BLF Grambangla Mid-term evaluation (c) Primary Information Collection in this Final Evaluation | (a) Secondary review for Source 'a' and 'b' (b) Information from GUC staff, NM staff, project beneficiaries / families, elected local representatives, other local community members interacting with the project | Open-ended Checklists |
| 5 | Reasons, external and internal to the project, of Over/Under-achievements against specific outcomes | --- As above --- | --- As above ---, & Consultant's own analysis | --- Not applicable --- |
| 6 | Recommendations for future | --- As above --- | Consultant's desk-based efforts | --- Not applicable --- |

6. MAJOR FINDINGS

6.1 Outcome-level Achievements

Outcome 1:

As implementation of the project started with relatively more of ground work in 2015-16, cumulative enrolment of children in GUC Primary School was relatively high at end of 2018, 241 out of a target of 200 students, an achievement by around 121%. Mainstreaming of the target children's education was significantly more difficult than enrolment at the project's primary school. The difficulty in this case was due to the two following reasons-

- The project needed some initial time in Year 1 to establish liaison and networking in this regard with the government's education-related entities, other nearby primary school, the parents and the local community.
- The project had to wait for certain students to graduate from Grade V, so they would be eligible to apply for getting admitted to mainstream schools.

With increasing liaison with especially related schools, the number of mainstreamed students increased over time. Starting with 13 students enrolled in 2015-16 against a target of 50, the cumulative achievement at end of 2018 was 138 (that is, 46%) against a cumulative target of 300. This positive trend in mainstreaming of students meant a two-fold change:

- Gradually increasing interest among the parents for promoting continued education of their children.
- Wider acceptance of the waste-picker children among the students, teachers and management of the mainstream schools at the project locality.

Therefore, it may be commented that the project's implementation resulted to a positive breakthrough in the embedded resistance (taboo) against including this type of 'excluded children' as students in the schools at large in Bangladesh.

In consideration of the gender-composition of the students enrolled, it is noteworthy that the proportion of male : female students was closely identical, with number of female students enrolled gradually increasing with passage of time of project implementation.



(Inside a classroom in GUC Primary School)

While the proportion of students mainstreamed was 57% (138 out of a total of 241), the proportion of female mainstreamed students alone was 25% (32 among 130), and that of male students was 11% (12 out of 111) only. A total of 6 PWDs were enrolled as students in GUC's primary school in 2015-16, that rose to 11 out of 204 in 2016-17. Their number (11) remain unchanged up to the end of the year 2018 when the total number of enrolled students rose to 241.

Discussions with the project's local community and GUC's management revealed that on completion of education at the GUC's primary school, a male student would be relatively less willing than a female student to continue his education on two specific grounds, such as:

- There are fewer institutional support in most of the mainstream schools than those in the GUC's school; and
- As the males are conventionally considered the major income-earners in a family in a rural Bangladesh setting, the project's male students also have a lower tendency after graduating from Grade V in GUC Primary School to further continue his education, as they are usually diverted more toward work for income-earning.

Table 2: Male/Female/PWD Distribution of Direct Beneficiaries

| Duration | July 2015-June 2016 | | | | | July 2016-June 2017 | | | | | July 2017-December 2018 | | | | | Cumulative Achievement |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------|------|--------|-----------------------------|---------------|---------------------|------|--------|-----------------------------|---------------|-------------------------|------|--------|----------------------|---------------|------------------------|
| Subject | Total Target | Male | Female | PWD. <i>Out of Total</i> | Achieved 2016 | Total Target | Male | Female | PWD, <i>Out of Total</i> | Achieved 2017 | Total Target | Male | Female | PWD, Out of Total | Achieved 2018 | |
| Outcome-1 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| No. of Enrolled GUC Students | 200 | 93 | 85 | 6 | 178 | 200 | 104 | 100 | 11 | 204 | 200 | 111 | 130 | 11 | 241 | 241 |
| Enrolled in Mainstream School | 50 | 3 | 10 | 0 | 13 | 125 | 46 | 35 | 0 | 81 | 200 | 12 | 32 | 0 | 44 | 138 |
| Outcome-2 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| No. of Students Trained | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Mobile Phone Servicing | 50 | 9 | 2 | 0 | 11 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 150 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 11 |
| Industrial Sewing | | 2 | 21 | 1 (M) | 23 | | 1 | 43 | 0 | 44 | | 7 | 95 | 0 | 102 | 169 |
| Jute & Paper Bag Making | | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | 1 | 29 | 0 | 30 | | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 30 |
| Food Processing | | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | 2 | 8 | 0 | 10 | | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 10 |
| Total No. of Trained | | - | - | - | 34 | | - | - | - | 84 | | - | - | 0 | 102 | 220 |
| No. of Students Job-placed | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Mobile Phone Servicing | 50 | 5 | 2 | 0 | 7 | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 150 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 7 |
| Industrial Sewing | | 2 | 19 | 1 (M) | 21 | | 1 | 29 | 0 | 30 | | 2 | 68 | 0 | 70 | 121 |
| Jute & Paper Bag Making | | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | 0 | 19 | 0 | 19 | | 0 | 8 | 0 | 8 | 27 |

| Duration | July 2015-June 2016 | | | | | July 2016-June 2017 | | | | | July 2017-December 2018 | | | | | Cumulative Achievement |
|----------------------------|---------------------|------|--------|-----------------------------|---------------|---------------------|------|--------|-----------------------------|---------------|-------------------------|------|--------|-------------------|---------------|------------------------|
| Subject | Total Target | Male | Female | PWD. <i>Out of Total</i> | Achieved 2016 | Total Target | Male | Female | PWD, <i>Out of Total</i> | Achieved 2017 | Total Target | Male | Female | PWD, Out of Total | Achieved 2018 | |
| Food Processing | | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | 2 | 5 | 0 | 7 | | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 7 |
| Total No. of Job Placement | | - | - | - | 28 | - | - | - | - | 56 | | - | - | - | 78 | 162 |
| Outcome-3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Member of SHGs | 40 | 0 | 27 | 0 | 27 | 100 | 0 | 85 | 0 | 85 | 100 | 0 | 109 | 0 | 109 | 109 |
| Outcome-4 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Birth Registration | 0 | 72 | 102 | 7 | 174 | 250 | 177 | 159 | 4 | 339 | 500 | 15 | 46 | 0 | 61 | 574 |
| Old age allowance | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 14 | 9 | 0 | 23 | | 4 | 19 | 0 | 23 | 46 |
| Widow allowance | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 6 | | 0 | 17 | 0 | 17 | 23 |
| Allowance for PWDs | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | - | 4 | | 8 | 4 | 12 | 12 | 16 |
| VGD | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | 16 | 0 | 16 | | 0 | 52 | 0 | 52 | 68 |
| Vaccination | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 126 | 0 | 163 | 163 |

Outcome 2:

Against a total target of 300 students to be trained on different trades, actual number of students trained was 220. Training was imparted on four specific trades, that is: (a) Mobile Phone Servicing, (b) Industrial Sewing, (c) Jute and paper Bag Making, and (d) Food processing. Among these four categories, the trail of training continued in the following pattern:

Table 3: Year-wise Continuity of Trade-specific Training

| Sl. No. | Specific Trade | Year-wise Continuity | | |
|---------|---------------------------|----------------------|--------|--------|
| | | Year 1 | Year 2 | Year 3 |
| 1 | Mobile Phone Servicing | √ | | |
| 2 | Industrial Sewing | √ | √ | √ |
| 3 | Jute and Paper Bag Making | | √ | |
| 4 | Food Processing | | √ | |

As can be seen above, 102 students (that is, 101 females and one male PWD) were most interested in receiving training on industrial sewing, especially for two particular reasons:

- It is a profession that can be pursued at home (not always at a typical marketplace) allowing minimum mobility of female entrepreneurs in this profession also taking care of household chores;
- It needs minimal capital investment; and
- The production mechanism is less intricate.



(Young girls' enthusiasm to receive training on industrial sewing)

Besides, it was reported that though some students (9 boys and 2 girls) had received training on Mobile Phone Servicing, their general observation was that this training was hi-tech for them and that students without high-level literacy could not assimilate the lessons and would not be able to start a business in this trade without some capital fund. Food Processing was learnt and practiced by 8 girls and 2 boys. A few of these girls started this business at or in the vicinity of their slum-based homes. The training on Jute and Paper Bag Making continued for some time in the year 2017-18. Though Matuail is an industrial base having high prospects for business in packing materials, the persistent strong competition from the bigger business entities subsequently made training on this trade relatively less attractive to the target students.

Quantity-wise the bulk of the training was received by 169 students (77%) out of a total number of 220, followed by 30 students (14%) in the area of Jute and Paper Bag Making.

The number of trade-wise job-placement of children followed the pattern of popularity of training on specific trades. As for instance, the proportion of students job-placed against Industrial Sewing and Jute and paper Bag Making were 121 (72%) out of 169 students and 27 (90%) out of 30 students.

Outcome 3:

SHGs were formed with a view to enhancing the target households' economic wellbeing, so they were able to consider accessing alternative sources of healthier and sustainable income to fend better for their waste-picker children.

The SHGs were imparted lessons on (a) SHG management, (b) social development issues like cleanliness and hygiene, women's rights, child rights, and (c) group savings for economic empowerment.

With an annual target of having 240 members in SHGs in the initial year (2015-16), the project had seen merely 27 members in that year. The benefits being drawn from SHGs by their members encouraged others to join different newly formed SHGs. Consequently, the project had a total of 109 members in 7 different SHGs at end of the year 2018. Only one SHG (Shapla SHG), out of a total of 8, got disbanded as per their respective Group By-law due to various unavoidable reasons.

The total number of memberships in the total of 8 SHGs at one point of time in January 2017 rose to 120. The rate of savings per person per month is dependent on the group members' preferences and abilities in any particular SHG. Currently, they have two specific levels of monthly savings- either BDT 100 or BDT 200 per member per month. The savings deposited with banks are given out as viable loans to group members for different loans, for personal or business purposes. The SHGs, having been formed at different points of time, have different levels of savings, loans disbursed and loan amounts recovered (Ref: Table 4 below).

Outcome 4:

The project witnessed regularly increasing progress in achievements against Outcome 4 as a result of regular advocacy and lobbying. The process paved the way for bargaining on rights of the project beneficiaries with the local government for them to access various social safety net-based

benefits, such as old age allowance, PWDs' allowance, widow allowance and VGD.



(An SHG member who has been the recipient of several social safety net services through the project's support)

Besides, Birth registration activity surpassed its total target by 74 against a target of 500 children. While birth-records of 11 PWDs were registered in 2015-16 to 2016-17, no PWD's birth was recorded in the year 2018. Vaccination under the EPI was provided to a total of 163 children, none out of whom was a PWD.

Table 4: Performance of the SHGs, during 2015/16 to 2018

| SI # | Name of Group | Area | No. of Member | Year of Formation | Amount of Monthly Savings/ Person | Total Group Savings | Total Amount of Disbursed Loan | Total Amount Repaid | Total Dues | No. of Borrowers | Purpose |
|------|-----------------|----------------------|---------------|-------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|------------|------------------|---|
| 1 | Mridhabari SHG | Mridhabari | 16 | Feb 2016 | 100 | Tk. 26900 | Tk. 10000 | Tk. 10000 | 0 | 2 | Purchasing rickshaw, Child's treatment |
| 2 | Golap SHG | Mridhabari | 18 | Jan 2017 | 100 | Tk. 1,200 | - | - | - | - | - |
| 3 | Shurjomukhi SHG | Matuail Moylar Rasta | 10 | May 2016 | 200 | Tk. 56800 | Tk. 65800 | Tk. 38308 | Tk. 27492 | 6 | Purchasing land, business |
| 4 | Doyel SHG | Matuail Moylar Rasta | 20 | Jan 2017 | 200 | Tk. 48000 | Tk. 22000 | Tk. 19600 | Tk. 2350 | 3 | Business, House maintenance , Treatment |
| 5 | Shurjo SHG | Matuail Moylar Rasta | 13 | Jan 2017 | 100 | Tk. 12500 | - | - | - | - | - |
| 6 | Shapla SHG | Bhanga Press | 30 | Jan 2017-Jun 2018 | 200 | Tk. 32200 | - | - | - | - | - |
| 7 | Samadnagar SHG | Samadnagar | 18 | Jan 2017 | 100 | Tk. 14500 | Tk. 10000 | Tk. 2500 | Tk. 7500 | 1 | Business |
| 8 | Shokal-Shondha | Bhanga Press | 14 | Dec 2017 | 200 | Tk. 6000 | - | - | - | - | - |

6.2 Effectiveness of Approaches Followed

Outcome 1:

The above-target enrolment of students at the GUC Primary School and mainstreaming of many of these students into the country's public education system has engendered high-level enthusiasm among the direct beneficiaries as well as the local community members. They are now willing and planning to make the school sustainable. The local UP Chairman, in a conversation with the consultant, contemplated on donating, or arranging from other sources, some land for the school and the TVET Centre toward their full-fledged legal recognition by the country's public education system paving the way for easy financial support of the government to the school and the TVET Centre.

The mothers of the students at the GUC School are also now motivated to let their children continue receiving further education in future.

Some absences of students from the school did occur; but these absences did not result directly from the students' unwillingness to go to the school, and these absences were, rather, caused by sporadic disturbances in the local transportation system or due to flooding of the local roads due to heavy rainfall, in the rainy season.

Close and frequent contacts with the local education office facilitated registration of the GUC's schoolteachers as a recognized education workforce in the project locality. This has been stated by Mr. Nazrul Islam, Assistant Head Teacher of the Matuail Poschimpara Primary School, in an interview with the consultant. Besides, the GUC Primary School has been recognized as a solid contributor to the country's education system. The following highlights on GUC's achievements tell of this fact:

- GUC School's registration with the local education system
- Supply of free textbooks at the beginning of any academic year (month of January) by the local administration as a national-level policy
- GUC schoolteachers' engagement as invigilators in the public (Primary School certificate) examinations at the Matuail locality
- Training on improved teaching methods and ways on developing lesson plans.

Outcome 2:

Among the TVET courses, Industrial Sewing has been the most popular trade. This trade has proved viable and preferable to the female students for various socio-economic reasons. Besides, it was reported at several discussion sessions with varied community members at Matuail that it was relatively easier to fetch job orders from the local market for making clothes for especially the kids. Additionally, the growth of mini readymade garment factories at Matuails' neighbourhood promises more frequent, larger job orders to the GUC TVET Centre for making garments in future.

The female students at certain localities of Matuail are pursuing their businesses in Food Processing, allowing these girls to carry on businesses from their slum-based homes and at the same time attending their other home-based responsibilities.

To view the consequences of TVET beyond the box, certain adults (members of SHGs) have also come up with initiatives of businesses to their understanding and preferences. They got their ideas to start these businesses from the GUC TVET Centre. Particular trades started by them are: Tailoring, Food Processing, and Small Grocery. A few of the other SHG members are involved in making and selling *pitha* (indigenous delicacy cakes), other types of snacks and tea at the project locality.

Through having operated in the local market subsequent to getting trained on various trades, the TVET students and their mothers have now come to understand how to assess viability of a business and also realizing the intricacies of market.

Outcome 3:

Whatever outcome-based achievements have been made by the SHGs, it is also apparent that the SHG members have been equipped with the knowledge and experience in running small cooperatives.

One of the traits inculcated among the SHG members is the sense that their disbursement of loans must always be viable resulting to healthy loan recovery rate. The results of their financial operations shown in Table 4 of this report indicates this fact. The importance of financial wellbeing for holistic development has been well-understood by them. Despite having gained some financial solvency, they are nowadays less interested to seek loans from external 'exploitative sources' like other NGOs or banks. AS financial health of the groups (SHGs) has provided them with some scope for self-financing, they are now more interested than before to manage their SHGs well for sustainability of their outcome. This seems to be a clear demonstration effect of operation of the SHGs over the last three and a half years.

The practical impact of understanding about importance of financial wellbeing among SHG members was also apparent to the consultant when he spoke to an SHG member named Bilquis. She is 21 years old, married and recently abandoned by her renegade husband. She has three children, among whom the oldest is 7 years old and the youngest 6 months old. As of the day of the interview with the consultant, she had saved a total of BDT 6,400 with her SHG. She, until recently, picked and traded on waste materials from the dump site. Six months ago, in despair because of her abandonment by her husband, she started selling boiled eggs and different types of *pitha* (indigenous delicacy cake) at a location near the dump site. Bilquis plans to fend for her family of four through this newly started business. As of date, she has not borrowed any loan from her SHG (Surjyamukhee SHG) and has been financing her new business with her own savings.



(The consultant for the final evaluation and some GUC staff with Bilquis, a confident, hard-struggling SHG member selling street food)

The consultant met three SHG members (of Surjyamukhee SHG) at the waste dump site. They were: Marium, Rekha and Saleha. They said that they had borrowed BDT 10,000, BDT 5,200 and BDT 5,000 respectively and started scrap business jointly. Reportedly, they have become benefitted from the group, especially as they have control over their money. The SHG has decided on the rate of interest (12% per annum) levied on their loans.



(The consultant for the final evaluation and two GUC staff having a discussion with three members of the Surjyamukhee SHG)

At the end of the year, the SHG members themselves get back their interest as dividends. The SHG members have also learnt in details book keeping, bank account management, and different issues of health and hygiene.

Their group savings now stands at BDT 73,000. They are confident that they have the likelihood of being able to sustain their SHG's operations in future even in absence of any support of GUC.

6.3 Key Success Factors and Challenges Faced

A) Success Factors:

Outcome 1:

- The parents of the students at the GUC Primary School have become motivated enough to allow their children's continued education. This change has happened apparently due to the following reasons-
 - Motivation of the parents by the project staff on benefits of children's education
 - Increased institutional support provided by the GUC School
 - Location of the project school in the vicinity of their homes making it convenient for the children, especially the girls, to travel from homes to the school relatively easily.
- Wider acceptance of the child waste-pickers as students by the other students and the teachers in the mainstream schools worked as a strong impetus for the students as well as their parents to support the children's education and their subsequent admission into mainstream schools. This level of acceptance of the waste-picking children helped in breaking the previous taboo of looking down on the child waste-pickers.
- Cooperation of local education office and schools led to professional enrichment of GUC School and its teachers by way of-
 - Training of GUC School's teachers
 - Supply of free textbooks to the GUC School's students
 - Engagement of GUC School's teachers in invigilation over PSC examinations.
- The community of women and their families operating as direct beneficiaries of the project continued, even far more strongly than before as a result of the intervention by this project. Consequently, the project gained increasing efficiency in its overall operations since its inception. Reportedly, a few of the families returned to their rural homes in the southwestern districts of the country; and such success stories vigorously enhanced the motivation of the homogenous community of the target population to remain closely bonded.
- The philanthropic activities of the local elite to benefit the project women and their families pervaded, especially from the second year of project activities. This worked as a morale-boosting factors among the project beneficiaries.
- The Government's generous policy of academic provisions to the students of Grade I-V was followed closely by the local education office to significant benefits of the GUC School's students.
- Food subsidy and healthcare to the project's students, initiated in the first year, were a remarkable factor for motivation of the target families to allow education of their children at the

GUC School and to participate in other activities (such as receiving various training and joining in different rights-based rallies) of the project.

- The GUC School's teaching staff got trained on improved teaching methods from locally operating NGOs, besides having received similar support from the local education office and other local schools.
- Students' exchange visits to other local schools, especially the mainstream ones, helped to positively change their personality traits, learning positive lessons from the mainstream schoolboys and their teachers.
- The teacher : student ratio at the GUC School is significantly higher than those generally prevailing in other local (mainstream) schools. This gave the GUC School's teachers an edge over those in other local schools to command better control on and promotion of education of the students.

Outcome 2:

- Industrial Sewing is a trade that can be pursued easily with minimal capital and relatively high profitability. As such, its popularity grew significantly above those of other trades.
- There is abundant demand for kids' clothes existing in the Matuail market, which assisted the TVET students at the project to obtain a few job orders to make and supply such clothes.
- In the RMG sector, emphasis of global buyers and the Bangladesh Government on compliance to ethical rules caused some of the RMG firms to lose their major shares in the export-oriented RMG market. Consequently, smaller manufacturing units are now placed with the relatively more stable and compliant RMG units. Consequently, there has been a rise in the number of smaller RMG firms at various regions of the country. Similar has been the situation at Matuail, Dhaka city. As a spill-over of this phenomenon, there has been an increasing number of smaller, local market-oriented RMG firms at Matuail, where the children (mostly girls) trained by the Tailoring Section of GUC's Project Office get easily employed. It was also reported that (i) the children trained by GUC's training centre are more literate than the average RMG worker across the country, and (ii) they are more skilled than the average RMG worker of the country. These facts were revealed by the owner of two local RMG factories.

Outcome 3:

- Generous agreement of the local elected representatives led to provision of various relief support to the mothers of the waste-picker children under the Government's Social Safety Net Programme.
- The SHG members are remarkably money-cautious, and this trait of these women helped them to handle their own money carefully ensured profits for them and their SHGs.

B) Challenges Faced:

Outcome 1:

- The administrative structure at Matuail was not initially positive about allowing students of GUC School to be admitted at the local mainstream schools. It needed some initial efforts for liaison and motivational work to make agree to allow this mainstreaming of waste-picker students.
- The road condition between the GUC School and the homes of majority of its students was poor, taking the students a long, difficult time to commute through the given routes. On the other hand, these roads and its adjoining areas got easily inundated during the rainy season. As this precarious situation continued throughout the project period, the students faced many difficulties in attending their classes at the project school.
- GUC also needed to wait for some time at the initial stage of the project to have a significant number of students who could graduate from Grade V to be admitted to mainstream schools.
- Availability of PWDs among the target children was significantly low. By the end of 2018, total number of target PWDs was merely 11 against a target of 15.
- As men are usually considered the first-priority 'income-earners' in a typical Bangladeshi family, the project boys of Grade V are relatively less willing to further continue their education, consequently to be admitted to the mainstream schools.
- The widely prevailing view of girls as being required to work mostly at home acted, to some extent, against the attendance of girls at the GUIC Primary School. Even in the face of such embedded constraints, GUC's enhanced PR, among other promoting factors, allowed a surge in girls' attendance and performance at the project school (Table 2).
- Despite the positivity and generosity with which the local education department cooperated with the project, GUC found it extremely difficult to enhance financial wellbeing of the students through provision of stipends for them from the government. As such stipends are normally provided to students of governmental primary schools, it was finally not possible for GUC students to avail of such stipends.

Outcome 2:

- Nari Maitree, the NGO responsible for implementation of this component, faced a bit of a problem in conducting a fresh household survey which they were supposed to conduct at the initial stage of the project's implementation, because many of the households that accommodated target families of the project, were either vacant or filled with new entrants following migration of the originally registered families.
- Although Nari Maitree primarily targeted imparting TVET-oriented training on six trades in all, subsequent changes in the demand pattern in the market locality forced them to limit themselves on four particular trades only, that is, Industrial Sewing, Mobile Phone Servicing, Jute and Paper Bag Making and Food Processing.
- Training on Mobile Phone Servicing needed some knowledge in hi-tech issues and a bit of better literacy, which were mostly lacking in majority of the TVET students.
- Persistent strong competition from big companies, manufacturing Jute and Paper Bags, was a deterrent to encouragement of TVET students to learn the art of making such bags.

- Business of food Processing picked up among the girls that received training on this trade. But, among them, majority had a tendency to locate their business activities at or in the vicinity of their slum-based home, attending household chores and their business in Food Processing. Consequently, they fell short of making optimal profits out of this trade. Their further attachment to similar projects/activities aimed at increasing women's mobility may open a wider way to their better profit-making in such businesses in future.

Outcome 3:

- Initially, encouragement of women to become SHG members was low, which rose through time as a result of benefits flowing from such memberships.
- The women and girls in the project trained on Food Processing tended to operate their business in this sector at locations in their own slums, preferably as close as possible to their homes. This indicates that though some improvement has been made to the attitude of project women about allowing free movement of women in the society, there is still need for further work on the issue of their freedom of movement.

6.4 GUC's Organisational Capacity

Having recruited project staff timely, especially in the initial year (2015-16), the different positions in the project's organisation structure was well-equipped, having staff of the required specifications at both GUC HQ in Dhaka and the Project's field area. At a subsequent stage, even in the face of increased responsibilities on GUC with a change in partnership pattern, this lead partner (GUC) managed the project with enough staffing for three Project Outcomes- Outcome # 1, 3 and 4.

Staff capacity clearly showed signs of improvement, manifest firstly in the progress on major project activities documented in some tables in this report (Table # 2-4). Besides, the consultant witnessed practically the staff's improved performance during his participation in a number of sharing meetings of the project at the GUC HQ for monitoring purposes. The consultant, also being a critical witness to the project at two phases, mid-term evaluation and final evaluation of the project, has further confirmation of this pattern of staff development at GUC, mainly through on-the-job training.

In order to ensure smooth and un-interrupted monitoring of the project, the lead partner NGO recruited an M&E Officer immediately on initiation of the project's implementation activities. The consultant had close interactions with this M&E Officer, among other staff, at both the phases of the project's evaluation- mid-term and final evaluations.

Both GUC and Nari Maitree followed closely the provisions of their relevant operations manuals in routine activities of the project.

Though the staff were given their respective job descriptions indicating their specific activities and related aspects, there were surely certain moments during the last three-and-a-half years when seriously concerted efforts were needed making exceptions to tackle emergency situations. During such times, GUC successfully allowed and utilized their culture of matrix pattern of accountability and communication, facilitating easy solution to the lurking problems. As for instance, the Advocacy Officer who has been long working with GUC even from before the project's inception, had to carry on numerous motivational efforts in order to ensure community participation and cooperation of various

governmental and non-governmental sources of services at the project locality. GUC staff, at such moments, went out of the box to remedy project problems as immediately as possible.

ChildHope's support with frequent monitoring-and-mentoring visits by its Partnerships and Project Manager was effective toward smooth project implementation. Besides, remote communication of ChildHope through emails and telephone calls with GUC and Nari Maitree was always timely and effective. In this regard, the necessary time of GUC and Nari Maitree made and reserved by them especially for purpose of their participation in such organizational development efforts proved effective. Alongside such special organizational activities, the two partner NGOs at the implementation level carried out their other routine project activities as per their predetermined project activity schedule. ChildHope (UK)'s efforts that especially drove these organizational development efforts have been highlighted in Table 5 under Section 6.6.

6.5 Partnership Management

As already mentioned in the report on the project's mid-evaluation, GUC shouldered increased responsibilities as a partner as a consequence of some teething problems regarding partner-wise sharing of duties. Having done that, GUC led management of the project smoothly. Nari Maitree (responsible for implementing Outcome 2) and GUC (the lead partner) had a positive team chemistry in the changed scenario of partner-specific responsibility-sharing.

Besides, Childhope (UK) gave all-out support to the two partners from the UK as well as through visits to the project offices and the project site at least once in six months. ChildHope (UK)'s support to the project has been instrumental in that it led to necessary organizational strengthening of the implementing partner NGOs as well as ensuring compliance of project implementation and monitoring with the predetermined principles mentioned in the project proposal.

6.6 ChildHope's Role and Effectiveness

ChildHope successfully carried out its double-sided responsibilities. On one hand, it maintained all sorts of communication, negotiation and reporting with BLF. On the other hand, it bore the responsibility for all-out implementation of the project in cooperation with the multiple partners in Bangladesh.

ChildHope's fulfilment of its responsibilities called for multiple visits of its representative(s) to Bangladesh, and frequent communication via emails and phone calls. In one word, the visits made by ChildHope personnel to the project country were at the same time for purpose of monitoring and mentoring. To sum up activities around staff development by ChildHope, the following may be mentioned:

- Training to staff of GUC and Nari Maitree several times in Dhaka by Childhope staff and local consultant(s)
- Hiring of international consultants from outside the project or Bangladesh to train the project on several occasions
- Liaison made by ChildHope between GUC and IDS regarding future initiatives to lead to project initiatives with moral linkage with the BLF project
- Arranging foreign trips of the project staff for their professional enrichment, to different Asian countries

- ChildHope’s maintenance of several other partners in Bangladesh promoting the common cause of child welfare/protection in the long run. This added to multifaceted relevant knowledge at the end of both ChildHope and GUC.

As can be observed in the above list, ChildHope (UK) engaged itself in diverse steps for human resource development in GUC and its partner NGO. These steps consisted of both theoretical learnings and practice sessions coupled with practical project visits to local and overseas destinations. Details of such specific efforts are given in the table below.

Table 5: Capacity Building Trainings for the Project Staff, July 2015-31 December 2018

| Sl. No. | Training Title | Duration/ Date | Facilitator | Training Topic |
|---------|---|------------------------------------|--|---|
| 1 | Workshop on Communication, Team Building & Documentation | 27-29 July 2015 | Rajni Singh Shivakoti | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communication • Team Building • Documentation |
| 2 | Training Workshop on Child Protection | 8 September 2015 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A K M Maksud • Joyeeta Hossain | Different issues related to child protection like abusing, negligence and exploitation and steps to protect children |
| 3 | Training of Teachers on Inclusive Education, Health Education and Hygiene & Methods for Assessing Needs of Children with Disabilities | 7, 9, 11, 14, 21, 28 November 2015 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Matuail Poshchim Para Government Primary School • National Centre for Special Education • Mosharraf Hossain • Sadia Afrose and Bipul Chakraborty, CSID • Md. Shah Alaam, CAMPE | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teaching Method and Early Childhood Development • Inclusive Education & Disability • Education Program Management & Monitoring |
| 4 | Training Workshop on Development approaches, intervention models and Project monitoring and reporting | 8 - 10 December 2015 | Khilesh Chaturvedi | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approaches to development • Understanding Participation – levels of participation and People led development • Process of People led development • Concept of facilitation • Role of facilitator and Do's and Don'ts of facilitation • Changing role of facilitator during the Process of People led development • Self Help Group (SHG) – difference from Savings (primary) groups – ownership, styles of facilitation |

| Sl. No. | Training Title | Duration/ Date | Facilitator | Training Topic |
|---------|--|---------------------|--|---|
| | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Facilitating formation / functioning of SHG • Model norms / guidelines for SHG • What is Rights Based approach (RBA) and Why RBA • Individual rights versus Community rights / sense of well- being (seeking perspectives on borderline issues) • Advocacy – concept and need • Process and methods of advocacy • Conclusion and evaluation |
| 5 | Training Workshop on Health & Nutrition for the project team of Education & Health for Child Waste Pickers | 6 – 7 February 2016 | Swapan Saha | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understanding the concept of HDDS • Various low cost nutritious food practices • Examples/case of some best practices around nutrition and hygiene • Development of a module |
| 6 | Training Workshop on Monitoring for the project team of Education & Health for Child Waste Pickers | 22 February 2016 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amit Arulanantham • Mozammel Hoque | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concept of monitoring and evaluation • The terminology used in an M&E framework, to work together as a team • Different parts of BLF-M & E framework • How to utilize team/staff meeting to draw learning and reflection, to improve project implementation |
| 6 | Exposure Visit to India | 24-31 March 2016 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Khilesh Chaturvedi • Arpana Research & Charities Trust at Karnal, Haryana | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Acquiring practical knowledge on the process of Self Help Group (SHG) |

| Sl. No. | Training Title | Duration/ Date | Facilitator | Training Topic |
|---------|---|----------------------|--|--|
| | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Munish Kaushik • Laxmi Sansthan at Ghaziabad in Uttar Pradesh • Butterflies, Delhi | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Observing different right based approach and advocacy initiatives • Understanding the concept of Child Development Khazana • Improving reporting skills and documenting case studies |
| 7 | Follow-up Training Workshop on Self Help Group and Advocacy | 12-16 February 2017 | Khilesh Chaturvedi | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self Help Group (SHG) model • Concept of Facilitation and role of facilitator in developing SHGs • People led Advocacy • Monitoring of project progress and reporting |
| 8 | Global Partners Learning Workshop On Disability Inclusion And Livelihoods (Bangkok, Thailand) | 17-22 September 2017 | ChildHope UK | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Disability Inclusion • Livelihood |
| 9 | Follow-up Training Workshop on Self Help Group and Advocacy | 19-20 February 2018 | Khilesh Chaturvedi | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self Help Group (SHG) model • Trade Union for the waste pickers • Advocacy for legal framework for SHGs |

To conclude, as the project staff maintain, their total experience of work and learning in this project have enabled them to serve the project's immediate interests as well as place themselves on a sound footing of knowledge and experience that would pave their way to further effective work for the disadvantaged children and their families in future.

6.7 Financial Performance of the Project

In course of every finance-related activity, the concerned project personnel at the end of both ChildHope (UK) and the two partner NGOs in Bangladesh did abide by all related rules governed by the NGO Affairs Bureau of Bangladesh and the management of ChildHope (UK).

(a) Local Audit Process:

Every year, during the Annual General Meeting, the management of Grambangla Unnayan Committee proposed the names of three audit firms to the General Body. Then, the General Body selected an audit firm from amongst the three proposed firms and recruited the independent auditor. After the recruitment, the auditor audited GUC's accounts-related documents and developed the report maintaining rules related to the Bangladesh Standards of Auditing (BSA). After the report preparation, NGO Affairs Bureau validated the report.

(b) ChildHope's Financial Monitoring:

In order to monitor and determine the short- and long-term results of the project activities assessing progress towards each Outcome, a particular M&E framework was designed by identifying the key indicators for each of the four outcomes, along with associated targets, milestones and means of verification.

In every quarter, the Partnerships and Programme Manager (PPM) of ChildHope UK used to visit the project area and conduct participatory monitoring with the Project Manager, the Monitoring and Learning Officer, the Accounts Officer, the teachers, caregivers, the Field Officers and the beneficiaries. The PPM also participated in the Project Steering Group's meetings where the Project Manager, the Monitoring and Learning Officer and the Executive Director of the partner NGO also participated and discussed about different issues related to the project activities. Every year, an annual learning review meeting was organized where, in the presence of the PPM, the field staff and the Monitoring Officer discussed the challenges, reasons behind the problems, the steps to solve the problems, the results and the learnings in a participatory way.

(c) Quarterly Programmatic and Financial Reporting:

In every quarter of a year, following the prescribing formats, both the programmatic report and the financial report were sent by GUC to ChildHope UK. In order to develop the programmatic report, the monitoring framework was strictly maintained, where the output target and progress were described.

GUC used to submit three types of reports to ChildHope UK, such as-

- Quarterly Reports

- Six monthly Reports
- Yearly Reports.

(d) NGO Bureau's Approval to Receive Foreign Donations:

Before starting the project, GUC filled up and submitted the FD-2 and FD-6 Forms to the NGO Affaires Bureau (NGOAB). After NGOAB's approval, the project's implementation started. Every year, GUC submitted both annual programmatic and financial reports to them. Besides, an Inspection team from the NGOAB also inspected the project activities and developed a report on their inspection visit.

The result of the compliance with standards rules for financial accounting was a smooth pattern of fund flow, conduction of project activities, results monitoring and overall transparency in utilization of all project resources. As a partial reflection of the fact, a comparative picture of three-year budget and expenditures has been shown in the table below.

Financial Statement for the BLF project budget vs expenditure as per annual reports

| Year | Budget BLF | Expenditure |
|----------------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| Y1 July 15 - June 16 | £129,563 | £117,455 |
| Y2 July 16 - June 17 | £138,184 | £146,352 |
| Y3 July 17 - June 18 | £137,491 | £130,298 |
| Y4 July 18 - Mar 19 | £69,379 | £82,444 |
| | £474,617 | £476,549 |

7 RECOMMENDATIONS

The project, having completed its implementation by end of the year 2018, is now poised to find out its new course, if any, because, as usually expected of typical development projects, not all the objectives of the project have been fully realized. In this context, the project authority(ies) should consider the next course of action based on multiple priorities and choices following the actual needs of the target beneficiaries. The following suggestions may be conceived as of now within the current context:

- (a) Make/continue liaison with the local government (Union Parishad) at Matuail for mobilisation of all necessary resources available at their end to render sustainability to the project, such as:
 - Obtaining land for the GUC School and GUC TVET Centre; and
 - Registration of the GUC Primary School as a governmental registered primary school, so the government's MPO (Monthly Pay Order) and other support are available as the necessary financial resources.
- (b) Establish a strong linkage with the local market to explore potentials of selling commodities produced by the GUC TVET Centre in future (This proposal, at the outset, needs assurance of smooth and un-interrupted flow of necessary funds, including that for accommodation on any rental floor space).
- (c) ChildHope and GUC, along with other local representatives, should share the thoughts on possible future of the project (This conversation should follow preferences and priorities already shown by any donor approached by ChildHope and/or GUC)
- (d) Both ChildHope and GUC need to strategize a future approach to be made to other donors (than BLF) for rationally modified continuation of the project, especially in consideration of previous experiences faced in course of the immediately past project.